### Theme 1: Inequalities in care: global, local and transnational dynamics in an age of migration

#### Session 1A: Transnationality and care in contexts of ageing

**Chair:** Majella Kilkey  
**Discussant:** Magda Lőrinc

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domiziana Turcatti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Migrant-Led NGOs as the Hope in Austerity and Anti-Immigrant Times? The Case of a London-Based NGO Run by Latin Americans, Supporting Latin Americans to Overcome Care Inequalities</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Affiliation:** University of Oxford  
**Other authors and affiliations:** Kiara Assaraf, University of Westminster |
| **This paper presents the case of a London-based non-governmental organisation (NGO) run by Latin American migrants whose goal is to improve the wellbeing of its ‘clients’ -- typically low-income, working-age, and documented Latin American women and men with diverse health needs. The role of NGOs in mitigating migrants’ care inequalities remains understudied. As such, this paper focuses on the manner in which this NGO addresses the inequalities its clients face in receiving (in)formal care and in fulfilling their social reproductive responsibilities within their transnational/multi-local families. Framed by the literature exploring the intersection between care, migration, and family, our research relies on 230 hours of ethnographic fieldwork conducted within this NGO (October 2018 - July 2019) by Domiziana Turcatti during her MPhil and on the structured surveys conducted by Kiara Assaraf (January 2018 - July 2019) as one of the NGO’s Project Coordinator. Our findings reveal that, despite limited resources due to austerity measures, this NGO supports migrants to overcome the exclusion faced in accessing the welfare state, an issue made more salient by Brexit, while providing a space for accessing emotional and social support. Fundamental to the survival of many clients, this NGO is particularly important for low-income single mothers with complex health needs and multiple responsibilities within their transnational families. While calling for the need of appreciating a health lens within migration research and reforming UK’s welfare state and migration policies, it highlights the importance of NGOs run by migrants for migrants to overcome inequalities in receiving and giving care in times of austerity and anti-immigrant measures.** |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dora Sampaio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Caring by silence: How (un)documented Brazilian migrants enact silence as a care practice for ageing parents</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affiliation:</strong> Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>While existing work on transnational aging and care has largely focused on the substance of transnational communication and what is being said, this article examines what is being ‘silenced’ during transnational exchange. I argue that to better understand aging and intergenerational caregiving we need to pay careful attention to what is not being said during transnational contacts, suggesting that silence and ‘communication voids’ are often formulated and enacted as a care practice. Drawing on ethnographic research with Brazilian migrants in the United States whose aging parents live in Brazil, I illustrate how migrants curate their lives abroad and sieve their lived experiences as an act of care for their aging parents back home. In so doing, I reveal the significance of faith as a coping strategy in the process of silencing and concealing emotions and as a means to fight loneliness, cope with adversity, and protect family exchanges.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Basak Bilecen  
**Simultaneous carework across borders: Kyrgyz migrant women caring for the elderly in Turkey and their families back at home**  
Affiliation: University of Groningen

| Drawing on qualitative interviews and participant observations in ten households in southern Turkey, Antalya with live-in migrant caregivers and their employers (usually the female children of dementia patients), this paper investigates live-in Kyrgyz migrant women’s transnational lives. In quest to have better life chances, Kyrgyz migrant women migrate to Turkey and yet their educational credentials are not fully recognized, so they end up working as live-in caregivers. Migrant women give care for the elderly in Turkey and simultaneously they have family obligations back in Kyrgyzstan and are expected to contribute their family lives emotionally and financially. While family obligations back home give Kyrgyz women the strength and motivation to further work as live-in caregivers even during times of conflict (with their own families and employers), simultaneity of transnational life also puts great stress and pressure on them. The results suggest that elderly care is perceived by the employers as ‘should be given by the family and kin’, and not by ‘strangers’; however given the economic conditions, increased need of labor market participation of women in Turkey, and the perceived ‘better skills’ of migrant women who can work as live-ins are the major conditions to hire them. Nevertheless, some tensions arise within those households with live-in migrant caregivers between the daughter and/or daughter-in laws who hire the migrant caregivers and migrants’ themselves due to asymmetrical power relations, different understandings of care, and frustrations of dependencies on each other. Therefore, this paper contributes to the literature on transnational care with an example of South-South global mobilities. |
### Theme 1: Inequalities in care: global, local and transnational dynamics in an age of migration

**Session 1B: Migration, policies and separated families**

**Chair:** Kelly Hall  
**Discussant:** Reiko Ogawa

---

**Matt Withers**  
**Development without care? Familial separation and care depletion within Australia’s Pacific Labour Scheme**  
**Affiliation:** Macquarie University  
**Others authors and affiliations:** Elizabeth Hill; University of Sydney

Australia’s new Pacific Labour Scheme (PLS) aims to recruit temporary migrants from Pacific Island Countries (PICs) to work in the rural aged and disabled care sector, among other industries, and has been framed as a ‘triple win’ migration-development scheme. It is anticipated to become a highly feminised migration pathway, with many PLS recruits being young mothers and primary caregivers. With no provision for familial accompaniment under the scheme, migrant households will have to renegotiate established work and care roles under conditions of transnationalism. The implications for families ‘left behind’ have not been adequately considered, despite substantial evidence of adverse social and economic outcomes from other instances of feminised temporary labour migration throughout the Indo-Pacific region. In this article, we analyse how feminised migration in the region has intersected with gendered work and care regimes ‘under stress’ to produce complex forms of care depletion for migrant households. Appraising the existing literature around the unpaid care needs of migrant families in a variety of countries of origin, we identify three forms of adaptive strategy undertaken to manage transnational family life: shifting gender norms; digitally intermediated caring; and the act of financially ‘remitting care’. These strategies are understood as agentic, but only partially remedial, responses to the challenges of transnational family life. We argue that the PLS risks reproducing unsustainable care arrangements for migrant families and their communities in PICs and, if earnestly considered a development scheme, must be augmented by significant investments in PIC care infrastructure to support decent care outcomes.

---

**Li-Fang Liang**  
**Doing transnational caregiving: Indonesian migrant live-in care workers and their left/stay behind aged parents**  
**Affiliation:** Department of Sociology, National Dong-Hwa University

The increase flow of migrant care workers from poorer countries to wealthier countries highlights the urgency of care labour deficits in the context of global ageing. The group of migrants, mostly are women taking care of the elderly and disabled people in receiving countries, and leave their aged parents and children back home. The majority of them have kept moving forth and back between receiving and sending countries for a long time. Their lived experiences demonstrate the trajectory of temporary labour migration.

The research on migrant care workers has paid attention to their working conditions and experiences in receiving countries. But so far, we know very little about how they maintain their care responsibilities, make care arrangement, and carry out care work in the transnational context. Migrant care workers in Taiwan are under the guest workers scheme. They are not entitled to the rights of family reunion and naturalisation as Taiwan citizens. This study focuses on the care/care work for aged parents of migrant care workers, including the two main questions:

1. How do migrant care workers negotiate care responsibilities with their aged parents and other family members either back home or overseas?
2. How do migrant care workers maintain their care responsibilities while tworking overseas? What kind of difficulties and challenges do they confront? How do they deal with difficulties and challenges?

Based on the findings, this study aims to provide further discussion on the crisis of care ethic and the issue of care justice in the transnational context.

---

**Majella Kilkey**  
**(Im)mobility in selective and competitive migration regimes: discourses and policies on ageing parents in the UK and Australia**
Proximate care, requiring physical co-presence, is an enduring and integral element of transnational care relationships (Merla, Kilkey & Baldassar, 2016). Migration regimes play a central role in mediating possibilities for proximity (Kilkey and Merla, 2014). As migration policies in many parts of the world become increasingly governed by the logics of selectivity and economic instrumentalism, mobility rights are ever more stratified. In this presentation, we seek to contribute to knowledge of such stratification processes and effects by focusing on aged-parent reunification discourses and policies. Situating aged-parent migration within the ‘transnational political economy of care’ (Williams, 2011), we understand this migration flow in dual terms. Firstly, aged parents in migrating to provide childcare for their children abroad are an unpaid component of the internationalised care labour force. Secondly, as a strategy families employ to meet care commitments – both childcare and elder care – when migration has dispersed care networks across borders, aged-parent migration is a dynamic of transnational care commitments.

Australia and the UK form the case studies for our analysis. These are archetypal examples of neoliberal migration regimes (Boucher and Gest, 2018), and in both migration policy has been radically transforming since the 2000s in line with selective- and competition-driven logics. In this context, we examine the parameters of the contestations around aged-parent migration and the ensuing policy developments. We highlight the stratification processes and effects of these developments particularly along gendered, classed and racialized lines. We conclude by articulating a ‘transnational ethics of family care’.

Tanja Ahlin
Gendered inequalities in care: the case of Indian nurses
Affiliation: University of Amsterdam

In Kerala, South India, where I conducted my ethnographic fieldwork, many young people, especially women, become nurses with the aim of finding employment abroad. The phenomenon of migrating Indian nurses is based on, and reproduces, various sorts of inequalities which are profoundly gendered. In this presentation, I first explore the international socioeconomic disparities that fuel global care chains. Specifically, I show how the conditions of healthcare employment in India perpetuate the economic precarity of nurses that stimulate their migration and simultaneously add to the significant scarcity of nurses in the country. I argue that besides being dependent on economy, these conditions have been grounded in a particular history of the nursing profession in India, including the way in which nursing is gendered. Second, I reflect on how the prospects of migrating and sending remittances to parents impacts the position of nurses as daughters. Particularly, I explore how their filial obligations have transformed in a transnational environment, created through the good employment prospects abroad. I maintain that while the bargaining power of daughters increases in some ways, the impact of this change on larger patriarchy remains questionable.

Kelly Hall
Ageing in Spain: Transnational Family Care for Older British Migrants
Affiliation: University of Birmingham

Spain continues to be the most popular retirement destination for British and other Northern European citizens. Most retired migrants move post-retirement when they are healthy and mobile, leaving behind their family in the UK. This paper explores what happens when older British migrants in Spain age and they require additional care and support, focusing on care strategies enacted within families. The paper draws on interviews with 35 older British migrants living in the Spanish Costa del Sol to highlight the complexity that migration can bring to care giving and receiving. Retired migrants were found to engage in three distinct transnational care strategies. First, ‘transnational care giving’ by children in the UK to their elderly parents in Spain; second, ‘joiners’ which involves elderly parents moving to Spain to receive care from their children already living there; and third, ‘returners’ where older migrants return to the UK in later life to receive care from their children. The findings highlight the importance of proximity in old age care and the difficulties of both providing and receiving care over national borders.
### Hildegard Theobald

**The involvement of migrants in home care settings in Germany: Dynamics of inequalities**  
Affiliation: University of Vechta

With the introduction of Long-term Care Insurance (LTCI), Germany made universal long-term care support available. LTCI emphasizes on publicly supported family care provision complemented by marketized professional care services. Within this framework, a complex mixture of different types of paid care work at home - professional home care services organized within the framework of LTCI as well as household-oriented services and 24-hours care arrangements within private households - gradually emerged. The expansion of care work in the distinct home care settings resulted in an increasing employment of migrant carers followed by the development of new patterns of inequalities. In the focus of the paper is the analysis of the involvement of migrant carers, the emerging patterns of inequalities within and between the distinct home care settings based on migration status and skill level against the background of an interaction of long-term care-, professionalization-, employment and migration policies.  

Theoretically, the paper draws, first, on concepts and approaches developed within international comparative welfare research for the analysis of the institutional frameworks of policy designs and their inequality-related effects. This is combined, second, with conceptual approaches created within the research strand intersectionality. Empirically, it is based on representative statistics and different representative inquiries as well as qualitative research findings to enable an integrated analysis of the developments within and between the three home care settings.

### Shereen Hussein

**The role and significance of place in migrant live-in carers’ wellbeing in the UK**  
Affiliation: London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine  
Other authors and affiliations: Agnes Turnpenny, PSSRU, University of Kent

**Background:**  
Live-in care is a rapidly expanding model of home care in the UK (Laing 2018). It is predominantly provided by migrants who might decide to work in this sector for a variety of reasons and organised through various formal and informal mechanisms. This paper aims to explore how different meanings of ‘place’ and ‘boundaries’ shape the wellbeing of migrant live-in carers in the UK.  

**Methods:**  
This is a qualitative study using semi-structured interviews with migrant live-in carers (n=15+). Interviews are transcribed verbatim and analysed thematically.  

**Results:**  
The paper will discuss migrants’ subjective wellbeing and how this is impacted by places and boundaries of live-in care. We will consider the role of ‘home’ and ‘space’, personal and virtual networks, and temporariness and security. The analysis considers live-in carers’ vulnerability at the intersections of migration, gender, and nature of work.  

**Discussion:**  
Potential policy implications for the organisation and provision of live-in care in the context of changing immigration policies will be discussed.

### Reiiko Ogawa

**Deregulation of migration regime and migrant care workers in Japan**  
Affiliation: Chiba University
In 2018, Japan’s aging population share 27.7% of the total population and de-population has already being felt. Responding to the rapid population aging and labor shortage, Japan reluctantly deregulated its migration regime and opened up the labor market in sectors such as agriculture, manufacturing, construction and care work. The labor shortage in care sector has been chronicle so several policy change took place without much coordination.

The first channel opened in 2008 under the Economic Partnership Agreement (EPA) between Japan and Southeast Asian countries. In 2017 two more channels were opened and finally in 2019 revised immigration law was enacted to accept 60,000 migrant care workers in the next five years. These four channels require different conditions and offer different career prospects as well as citizenship. Among the four channels, one is under Government to Government agreement and three is administered by private agencies which bring different impact to both the migrants and the employers.

The presentation first addresses how migrants are differently constructed to fit within the four channels by examining the migration trajectories from the sending countries to Japan. Secondly, it discusses the impact of deregulation of migration regime on the care labor market. The research data has been obtained through fieldwork in both Southeast Asia and Japan. It aims to provide empirical results on how institutional framework contribute in making of the migrant care workers as well as shaping the quality of care.
Melisa Yazdanpanahi
Caring relations and negotiation of independence within context of migration: The case of the Turkish community in London
Affiliation: PhD student, Heriot-Watt University, The Urban Institute, Edinburgh, UK
Other authors and affiliations: Ryan Woolrych, Associate Professor, Heriot-Watt University, The Urban Institute, Edinburgh, UK

Despite its centrality to social care discourse, independence remains an understudied notion, especially in relation to caring relations of older adults. This is especially important in the context of global migration, changing family dynamics and reformation of care policies in the Global North that adds to the complexity of the notion of independence and experience of it amongst migrant older adults. Drawing on 64 semi-structured individual interviews with older Turkish adults in London and service providers for the community, the paper seeks to present an understanding of older Turkish adults’ conceptualization and lived experience of independence in relation to social networks as informal supports and formal care supports within the community. Findings suggest that independence is a socially constructed concept being constantly negotiated in the context of changing family and community dynamics, explaining older Turkish adults’ expectations in terms of navigating care supports. Findings also show variation in the conceptualization of independence and experiences of it among different groups of the Turkish community in London according to migration origin, migration path, time of arrival to the UK and levels of adaptation to British society. We conclude by considering the implications this has for social care policy and practice in terms of delivering community and care interventions for older Turkish adults.

Rejoice Mazvirevesa Chipuro
Politics of gender, mobility and inequalities in care. Experiences of retired Zimbabwean nurses in the diaspora
Affiliation: University of Johannesburg

Recurrent global economic recessions precipitated increased financial insecurities and precarious employment that pushed professionals from the global South into migrant labor in the global North. The care sector in the UK gained from these global imbalances as it attracted hordes of international trained nurses, it also offered nursing training as a lucrative field for those aspiring to live and work in the UK. Two decades later, a number of these care workers are now retired or nearing retirement, and thus posing a new challenge to the care sector in both sending and receiving countries. The paper argues that these ageing, gendered, migrant bodies constitute key sites of struggle and inequality that shape migrant trajectories across space and time. The paper’s argument builds on theoretical notions of intersectionality, embodied cultural capital and translocality to enrich the discussion of global politics of care. Empirically, this paper is informed by in-depth exploratory interviews with both retired and near retirees Zimbabwean female nurses in Britain between 2018 and 2019. The aim was to gather data from the embodied contradictions, socio-economic struggles and agency employed by these nurses as they navigated transnational spaces imposed on their gender and vocation. The paper interrogates process of continuous adjustments and constant navigations for the older migrant nurses in question. By centering their lived experiences, the paper makes a case for adequate social policy in both the sending and receiving countries that supports people to age well and in so doing improving the quality of later life for all.

Louise Ryan
Analysing ageing in and out of place: The narratives of three migrant groups in London and South Yorkshire
Affiliation: London Metropolitan University
Other authors and affiliations: Majella Kilkey, Magdolna Lőrinc and Obert Tawodzera; University of Sheffield

In the context of an ageing society, there is increasing attention on how people navigate and make sense of particular places through the ageing process (May, 2011; van Dijk et al, 2015; Van Hees et al 2017; Kearns & Coleman 2017). ‘Ageing in Place is a key component of UK policy on older people and housing’ (Sixsmith & Sixsmith,
2008). Nonetheless, ageing coupled with bereavement and diminishing support networks, may impact on people’s sense of belonging in local places (May 2011). Of course, places are constructed and dynamic; continually made and remade over time (Massey, 2004). As well as perceived changes, there may also be material changes which impact on older people. For migrants, ageing and retirement may raise questions about return to the country of origin (Ryan, 2004). But return is not necessarily easy as ‘home places’ also change over time and migrants may no longer feel a sense of belonging there – feeling ‘out of place’ (Valentine & Sporton, 2009).

The paper draws on data from the Sustainable Care Programme. We explore the rich narratives of three groups of ageing migrants: Polish, Irish and African-Caribbean. Focusing on two distinct sites, London and South Yorkshire, we examine our participants’ dynamic relationships to places through intersections of age, gender, ethnicity and class.

Our research indicates that migrants’ experiences of ageing and care are locally embedded while transnationally connected, but also shifting through time. We consider the implications of our findings for the dominant policy agenda around ‘ageing in place’.
Onallia Esther Osei
Sustaining Ghanaian transnational parent–child relationships through WhatsApp: a youth-centric perspective
Affiliation: Maastricht University
Other authors and affiliations: Valentina Mazzucato and Karlijn Haagsman, Maastricht University

Current research on transnational families considers information communication technologies (ICTs or new media) central to sustaining familial ties but it also highlights that abilities to stay connected are not the same for all members of transnational families. Previous studies have focused mainly on how migrant parents communicate with their children at origin, and hence adopt an adult-centric lens. Yet, youth take an active part in these exchanges. Moreover, studies have focused mostly on ‘old’ ICTs such as phone calls, and most recently, Facebook and Skype. As ICTs continually change, we also need to look at new technologies that enable long-distance sociability, giving young people more room for manoeuvre. We address these gaps by investigating how young people who live in Ghana employ WhatsApp for sociability with their migrant parents. We show that youth are agentic herein and devise various strategies to experience a sense of being together across geographical distance.

Obert Tawodzera
Zimbabwean transnational families and new technologies: negotiating the interface between paid care work and unpaid transnational aged care
Affiliation: University of Sheffield
Other authors and affiliations: Louise Ryan (London Metropolitan University) Majella Kilkey (UoS) and Magda Lőrinc (UoS)

The proportion of migrant care workers who provide personal care, practical and emotional support to older people in the UK has increased over the years (Cangiano and Shutes, 2010). This reflects a broader global trend in relying on migrant care workers to mitigate the aged ‘care crisis’ currently being experienced by most developed countries. While the importance of migrant care workers in mitigating the elderly ‘care crisis’ is well documented in the UK, less is known about how they reconcile paid work with their own unpaid, familial, transnational care, especially for older family members. An important aspect allowing migrants to be able to reconcile paid work with their own familial caring responsibilities overseas is the emergence of new technologies, broadly defined, that potentially makes it possible for families to remain connected despite physical distance (Baldassar et al., 2017). Nonetheless, research shows that there are complexities to the use of new technology for long distance mediated care (Ryan et al., 2015).

Using data from the ongoing the UK ESRC-funded Sustainable Care Project (2017-2021), we explore the use of new technologies for transnational aged care by migrant care workers and their overseas family members. We also examine the implications of these migrants’ engagement with new technologies has upon social relations as well as patterns of care in a transnational context. Our research contributes to debates about the changing normative ideas and expectations about transnational care, family relationships, use of new technologies and global inequalities in access to new technologies.

Loretta Baldassar
Digital citizenship and mobility rights: Care inequalities affecting older migrants and left-behind parents
Affiliation: The University of Western Australia
Other authors and affiliations: Raelene Wilding, La Trobe University

This paper reports on two key dimensions of care inequalities from the perspective of ageing migrants and left-behind parents and grandparents: digital citizenship and mobility rights. Elsewhere, I have argued that any discussion of caregiving and mobilities in contemporary family life leads directly to an analysis of the role of digital technologies in sustaining relationships across distance (Baldassar 2016, see also Wilding 2006). More recently,
Merla, Kilkey and Baldassar (in press) argue that the current political context of restrictionist migration policies, characterized by immobility or highly conditional mobility, is dramatically affecting the contexts under which transnational families maintain their caregiving relationships. These two dimensions of care inequalities are particularly evident in the lives of older migrants and left-behind parents and grandparents, whose ability to care across distance is impacted by both uneven access and capacity to use digital technologies to engage in virtual forms of care, as well as limitations and restrictions on their capacity to move across borders to engage in proximate care. This double care jeopardy of digital and mobility exclusion for older adults is explored drawing on two research projects. Baldassar and Wilding’s notion of ‘digital kinning’ from their Ageing and New Media project highlights the challenges and inequalities in both proximate and distant care exchange for older migrants, especially those living in residential care facilities. While Hill, Hamilton, and… Baldassar’s new collaboration examines the mobility restrictions impacting left-behind parents and grandparents under Australia’s new temporary migration and visitor schemes. Both groups of older adults experience similar challenges to their digital citizenship and mobility rights due to ageist policy rhetorics that view older adults as a social burden and economic drain and highlight the need for a transnational ethics of family care (Kilkey and Baldassar in press) to support the mobility and digital inclusion of older people to give and receive both proximate and virtual forms of care.

**Weronika Kloc-Nowak**  
**Polish grandparents in the age of mobility: maintaining ties with grandchildren across geographical distance and national borders**  
Affiliation: Centre of Migration Research, University of Warsaw  
Others authors and affiliations: Sylwia Timoszuk, Warsaw School of Economics; Martin P. Piotrowski, University of Oklahoma

The paper presents the results of a research project (2019-2021) on grandparenting attitudes and practices’ adaptation to spatial mobility. By looking at a wide age-range of grandparents with families affected by internal and/or international migration this research bridges the gap between the literatures on transnational families and contemporary transformation of family practices. While there are many studies on the provision of personal childcare by grandparents hosting grandchildren or visiting them abroad, this research includes also emotional care between the grandparents and the grandchildren, as the type of care which may last into their adulthood. The main source of data is a survey (January 2020, N=1000) of grandparents living in Poland, where society combines strong intergenerational and family care obligations with intense outmigration. The survey data allow us to better understand how geographic distance affects grandparenting practices and how this is mediated by inequalities due to age, health, socio-economic characteristics and ICT literacy of the members of the grandparental generation. The analysis covers both in-person meetings, often tied to personal care provision, and remote communication frequency. Relative grandchildren location (living at larger distance or abroad) affects in-person contact but only for more frequent contact patterns, it does not increase the risk of having none in-person contact. Remote conversations once per week are the most popular pattern with both local and distant grandchildren, but not the ones abroad. Living in a large city and using ICT in everyday life reduces the probability of no contact with grandchildren (both in-person and remote).